Case 1:22-cv-00838-RJJ-PJG $\,$ ECF No. 85-69, PageID.1713 $\,$ Filed 04/09/25 $\,$ Page 1 $\,$ EXHIBIT $\,$ 69

IN THE MATTER OF: D.L. v. KALAMAZOO PUBLIC SCHOOLS, DOCKET NO.: 21-027515, **HEARING VOLUME I**

January 10, 2022

Prepared by



depos@networkreporting.com Phone: 800.632.2720 Fax: 800.968.8653 www.networkreporting.com

Let us assist you GLOBALLY for all of your deposition needs.

Respondent.

STATE OF MICHIGAN

MICHIGAN OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATION HEARINGS AND RULES In the matter of: Docket No.: 21-027515

D.L., Case No.: DP-21-0038 Petitioner, Agency: Education

ED Sp Ed Case Type: Kalamazoo Public Schools. Filing Type: Appeal

HEARING - VOL I

BEFORE MICHAEL ST. JOHN, ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE

via Microsoft Teams

Monday, January 10, 2022, 9:00 a.m.

APPEARANCES:

For the Petitioner:

MS. ERIN HANKINS DIAZ (P80388) MR. MITCHELL DAVID SICKON (P82407) Disability Rights Michigan (DRM) 4095 Legacy Parkway Lansing, Michigan 48911 (517) 487-1755

MS. ELIZABETH K. ABDNOUR (P78203) For the Petitioner:

Elizabeth Abdnour Law, PLLC 1100 West Saginaw Street, Suite 4A-2 Lansing, Michigan 48915 (517) 292-0067

MS. JACQUELYN BABINSKI (P83575) MI AECRES PO Box 705 Ludington, Michigan 49431 (231) 794-2379 For the Petitioner:

Page 1



PLAINTIFFS 00001404

MR. JORDAN MICHAEL BULLINGER (P72441) Clark Hill, PLC 200 Ottawa Avenue, NW, Suite 500 Grand Rapids, Michigan 49503 (616) 608-1146 For the Respondent:

For the Respondent:

MS. KATIE ILIJIC (ESQ) Clark Hill, PLC 500 Woodward Avenue, Suite 3500 Detroit, Michigan 48226 (313) 965-8300

7 Also Present: D.L., Reuquiyah Saunders

Marcy A. Klingshirn, CER 6924 Certified Electronic Recorder Network Reporting Corporation Firm Registration Number 8151 1-800-632-2720 RECORDED BY:

Page 2

Network Reporting / 800-632-2720

PLAINTIFFS 00001405

interesting, form a very small percentage of the basis for your evaluation; correct?

THE WITNESS: Yes

JUDGE ST. JOHN: Yeah. All right. You relied on the tests that you did and presumably you interviewed the

young man, too; right?

THE WITNESS: Yes, your Honor.

JUDGE ST. JOHN: And that that's the majority of your opinion. You review records in the past to give you

sort of a better view and to get a full picture, but the

vast majority of your opinion is based on your -- the tests that you did and the interview you performed with him;

correct?

THE WITNESS: Yes, your Honor.

JUDGE ST. JOHN: All right. Yeah. The objections

are noted but overruled. This is admitted as Petitioner's

Exhibit Number 2.

MS. DIAZ: Thank you.

(Petitioner's Exhibit 2 received) JUDGE ST. JOHN: All right. You're welcome. But

you have to give me a minute to make a note of that. All

right. Go ahead with your direct exam.

MS. DIAZ: Thank you.

24 Q Dr. Owens, through your evaluation what did you determine

about D.L.?

Page 43

NetworkReporting 800-632-2720

with the verbal and the nonverbal, but also there was the working memory which is huge, the attention piece. But in terms of accommodations, we would have emphasized -- and I'm -- sight based approaches, we would have had assistive devices, we would use audio text, we would use dictation systems such as speech to text. In addition to, you know, these interventions by the educational specialist to target his reading performance. Okay. And you had said his reading was at about a third grade level and his math is about a fourth grade level; is 12 A I would have to look at the report, but between third and fourth grade for the academic areas that I screened, yes. 14 0 Okay. And I apologize. You mentioned you wanted to talk about the working memory piece. So what kinds of accommodations would have helped with the working memory? 17 A Working structured situations, so where he would sit close to the teacher, where he would have had a desk that limited distractions, that he would have had a peer to help him stay on task as he spoke of daydreaming interfering with task performance. There are numerous things that an educational specialist could put in place and one of the things that would address both of them that is highly recommended and traditional is that he had a safe person that he could go to, to, one, reiterate what compensatory strategies that he Page 48

MS. ILIJIC: Objection; relevance. We're going back to 2012 again. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Response? MR. SICKON: Dr. Bateman's already established that the comprehensive battery of evaluations at the initial eligibility stage sets the foundation for the entire educational program. Missing information at that stage is critical. It informs all the rest of the educational programming going forward. JUDGE ST. JOHN: I mean, I think he's got a point there. I mean, I'm limited the remedy to two years back, but to the extent that they're going to establish that the -- or try and establish that the district missed things going back beyond two years. MS. ILIJIC: Can I respond? JUDGE ST. JOHN: Go ahead. MS. ILIJIC: As your Honor noted in your ruling on the orders, Child Find is an ongoing issue. So presumably if there was an issue in 2012, counsel can make a showing that there was also an issue in 2019 without creating a record that spans over a decade. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Well, but I think the point they're making is, is nobody looked in 2019, at least that's my understanding of their, their case. Is they weren't



Page 133

PLAINTIFFS 00001536

Network Reporting / 800-632-2720

PLAINTIFFS 00001537

looking in 2019 and they should have been because they had information as far back as 2012 with this document and teacher Brown's concerns. So I think that's appropriate, so your objection is overruled. So why don't you ask the question again, Counselor? Dr. Bateman, based on, you know, the teacher concerns that you're seeing both here and on the MET, what would you expect to see in terms of evaluations? 10 A I would have expected an evaluation to help us determine the social emotional needs of a student. Because of you having a teacher who's raised this, or basically waving this red flag saying that this student is having these problems seldom or never in this multiple areas, that I would have expected at least an evaluation that would have looked at some social emotional skills of this child and make a determination whether social or emotional skills were a weakness in addition to the reading problems that were highlighted as a part of the previous document. 20 Q No. That's what you would expect to see. What did you see? 21 **A** That -- I didn't see that. I just saw things related to 23 Q Oh, in terms of evaluations performed? I apologize. 24 A I'm sorry. I didn't see that. I only saw things relating to reading. I apologize if I didn't make myself clear.

800-632-2720

Network Reporting /

an expert what the impact is of not having that information at the outset for D.L.? Without that information, then you can't provide a -- you can't make an appropriate determination first about their full eligibility for special education services, and then you can't make an adequate determination about the appropriate programming for a child. Because with -without -- without information relating to any information related to social emotional issues, you can't provide programming that would help or assist if that was found to 13 0 MR. STCKON: I'd like to move now back to Respondent's Exhibit 6. (Judge shares exhibit via video) Now, in D.L.'s educational record, did you find any academic performance evaluations? 19 A There were -- occasionally there were some academic performance evaluations, but I think that maybe we can look more specifically at a document here to see as you scroll down that the review of existing data on this one. Okay. I mean, you have -- you have some -- you have some state assess- -- you have some state assessments, but state and district assessments since they're given as a group should

No. That's probably my fault. Now, could you describe as

NetworkReporting 800-632-2720

of 7

not be used to help make a determination about a child's individual educational programming. The individual assess- -- it's very specific that we need to make sure that the assessments provided to a child are individualized and given not as a part of a group administration. So, yes. But I would absolutely report group administered tests as a part of an evaluative tool. So I think it's appropriate that they did include that, such as that, but that's not what I would use to rely on where we are with the child. 10 Q Yeah. And so to that point, what is the difference between some of these more foundational evaluations you're talking about and let's say the NEWEA (sic) assessments or the state and local assessments? What's the difference between those? 14 A The individualized assessments are a normative basis that gives us some sense of where the child is functioning compared to their peers, exactly like the other ones are However, the NWEA and the other state assessments are typically given as a grade level assessment. And so if a child is not functioning at that grade level, it's not going to give an accurate determination yea or nay about how they're functioning. So the other one goes across a broader range of scores and a wide arrange of variability so we have a better sense of where the child's currently functioning. That's the purpose behind these tests. For instance, like I'll posit ones like we often give is the Woodcock-Johnson.

appropriate. However, for students eligible for special education related services, one of -- especially those with behavior problems, one of the things we have to look at very specifically is whether the behavior is a manifestation of the disability and are there appropriate goals and supports necessary to approve and work with said disability that the child has relating to their behavioral issues. Based on your review of the IEPs, were there supports in place to provide D.L. the appropriate skills to change his behavior to learn prosocial skills? 11 A MR, SICKON: Judge, I'd like to move to admit Plaintiff's (sic) Exhibit 23. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Any objection? MS. ILIJIC: No objection. JUDGE ST. JOHN: 23 is admitted then without objection. (Petitioner's Exhibit 23 received) Okay. And just one last question on this, Dr. Bateman. Would you expect more explanation in the rationale for their -- the school's determination? 22 A 23 Q Could you expand on that? 24 🗛 Yeah. I would expect more and what I would expect was clearly defined list of the behaviors this child is Page 196

Network Reporting
- STATE WIDE COURT PREPORTERS
800-632-2720

PLAINTIFFS 00001599

Network Reporting

- SINTENNOE COUNT REPORTERS
800-632-2720

Page 136

PLAINTIFFS 00001539

the football players that's doing GradPoint, too, would help 3 0 When you say they helped you, they -- they just sort of did it for you? 5 **A** Yeah. And I focused on my other classes. Okay. All right. Now one of the attorneys wanted me to ask you that there was -- there was somebody who stood in as sort of a father figure for you as you were growing up. Who was that? 10 A Can you repeat that? 11 Q That one of the attorneys wanted me to ask you about there 12 was somebody who stood in as sort of like a father figure 13 for you? It's a little hard to follow, but maybe your 1.4 cousin? Your cousin who passed away, is that --15 A Yeah. My ninth grade year. 16 0 Oh, ninth grade year. Okay. What happened to your cousin? 17. A 18 Q I'm sorry to hear that. All right. And he was sort of like a father figure to you? 20 A He was like a big brother. 21 Q Big brother. Okay. 22 A I think you talking about my uncle. 23 Q Oh, your uncle. Okay. 24 A Yeah. He died from a gun violence. 25 O Oh, I'm sorry to hear that, too. How old were you when that

Network Reporting /

800-632-2720

Page 251 2 **A** That was going in my senior year. 3 0 Oh, okay. 4 A Turning 18. 5 Q Was it over the summer before your senior year or during your senior year? 7. **A** Yeah, the summer. 6 C The summer. Okay. 9 A During football practice and stuff. 10 Q Oh, jeez. I'm sorry to hear that. How did that -- how did 11 that affect you, losing your cousin and losing your uncle? 12 A I stopped talking to people. 13 Q How long did that last? 14 A A minute. I feel like I was going to explode on somebody so 15 I just == but during that I had got in trouble during 16 football practice. I had to sit -- sit out two games 17. against two rival teams because I had got -- I had exploded 18 19 0 Yeah, that's a no-no. 20 A Yeah. But then I came back, played a game, and then I got kicked out of the last -- our last game, too. So senior year wasn't my best year. 23 Q Okay. Yeah. Sometimes that happens. Do you still want to 24 play do you think? 25 **A** Yeah.

Network Reporting

800-632-2720



PLAINTIFFS 00001686

Page 260 caught me doing that. 2 Q Okav. All right. We're getting there. So do you need a break? You doing okay? 4 **A** 5 Q Okay. Let's keep going then. I don't see any of the attorneys frantically waving their hands or harms to need a break, so we'll keep going. But I'm not really looking either, so -- do you remember going to some of these IEP team meetings, especially after you turned 18? 10 A Yeah. I remember the one in December. 11 Q Okay. Had they invited you to other ones before that or was that the first one? 13 **A** That was the -- that was the first one. 14 O Okay. All right. So if there was one earlier that they invited you to that maybe you didn't make it to --16 A 17 0 Yeah? Okav. 18 A I didn't have IEP meetings like that my whole four years. That was the first time. 20 Q Okay. All right. So what happened at that December IEP 22 **A** I was -- they wanted me to go to -- well, I wanted to graduate on time and they wanted me to switch schools and do it that way, but they said if I switched schools, I wasn't

> Network Reporting 800-632-2720

going to get help. But I feel like I wasn't getting help at

Page 261 Central anyway, so I might as well stay and graduate with the class that I -- I am and graduate with my friends. And somebody said that wasn't going to look good. I don't mber who said it in the meeting, but they said it wasn't going to look good for recruiting for football meets which in school is at the end of the year. That's when they said something about GradPoint. 8 0 And that's where you could recover some of the credits you 10 A 11 Q Yeah. Okav. Did you want to go -- it sounds like at some point somebody offered some summer school? 13 A Yeah. They said I could do summer school or I could do a lot of GradPoint classes, but once I do GradPoint I'm all on my own 16 Q Okav. 17 A I just decided to do the GradPoint. And my mom had told me don't go out the easy way. Don't switch schools at the last minute. Because at Phoenix, it's only 18 credits. That was taking the easy route. So she told me just fight it, then that's when I got to buckling down on my work. 22 O Okay. They talk about possibly coming back for a fifth year of high school? 24 **A** Yeah. George White had said -- he brung that up to me, but



he brung that up to me, like, the week before I graduated.

PLAINTIFFS 00001697

Page 334 it's very subjective. 2 Q You didn't do any testing that would have provided you with a full-scale IO for D.L.; correct? 4 A Correct. It's not required. The federal government and the state government doesn't require a cognitive assessments and they don't require standardized assessment for that fact either. So it's not a federal government requirement, it's not a state government requirement, and so, and I didn't feel that it was necessary as far as providing services for 11 Q And you didn't feel -- didn't feel like it was necessary to do a psychoeducational evaluation? 13 A No, I didn't feel like it was necessary to administer a 1.4 cognitive assessment 15 Q Okay. Yeah, and at the end of the REED in 2018 you found 16 that no additional needed -- data was needed to determine 17 D.L.'s educational needs; right? 18 A 19 Q Okay. I'd like to move on to behavior. In addition to 20 academic performance and cognitive ability, there are 21 evaluations for behavior; right? 22 A There are -- again, this is tricky. There are not -- there 23 are eval- -- when you do an evaluation, we have to look at 24 all eligibility areas. So I'm not -- I'm not saying I'm not 25

evaluation and I'm looking at all eligibility areas. 2 0 Okay. I was just asking if there were behavior evaluations? 3 A There are - there are rating scales that you can administer 4 that relate to behavior, correct. 5 0 Okay. And there's other kinds of assessments. For example, if there's information that you learned that a student was having behavior issues and you were aware that they had a 6 recent traumatic event, would it be appropriate to do a kind of trauma evaluation for that student? 10 A I'm not -- that is not an area of my expertise. I do not do 11 trauma evaluations. That would be something that I would -12 that I would try to connect them with a community mental 13 health resource depending on the severity of the trauma. 14 0 And during your time working with D.L., you knew that he had recurring behavior issues; right? 16 A I knew that there were some behavioral incidences, yes. However, they, as far as I understood, they were being addressed through a behavior plan MR. SICKON: And, Judge, if we could go, leave the REED and head to Petitioner's Exhibit 20. specifically Bates stamp number 317? And this one I think might be flipped. I'm not sure. This one got scanned a little bit funny. Yeah, thank you. 24 (Judge shares exhibit via video) 25 Q So here, Ms. Morcom, we're looking at a history of



doing an evaluation for behavior necessarily. I'm doing an

PLAINTIFFS 00001770

NetworkReporting 800-632-2720

IN THE MATTER OF: D.L. v. KALAMAZOO PUBLIC SCHOOLS, DOCKET NO., 21-107515, HEARING VOLUME II

January 11, 21

Page 370 under advisement, again, raising the standing objections we're going to begin to talk about the record. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Yeah. MR. BULLINGER: Putting the objection there. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Noted but overruled. The first page of this is 253, so --MR. SICKON: My apology. I will pull it up in my binder and give you a better number. 263, Judge. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Okav. Of 16. MR. SICKON: Yes. JUDGE ST. JOHN: 263. (Judge shares exhibit via video) MR. SICKON: Okay. And just so we can see the short term or actually the annual goal there? 15 Q Ms. Morcom, for this IEP in 2019, D.L.'s reading goal was to 16 progress from -- no, it was to include two details by reading various texts at grade level and use comprehension strategies to identify four to six important key details with 85 percent accuracy; isn't that right? 20 A Correct. MR. SICKON: And if we could move to Petitioner's Exhibit 17, please, Judge? And that's 278 for that Bates stamp. (Judge shares exhibit via video) 25 Q Okay. And, Ms. Morcom, this is an IEP for D.L. that's from



PLAINTIFFS 00001806

PLAINTIFFS 00001808

Page 371 October 2019; correct? 2 **A** I'm still looking at the goal for -- I don't know. I'm -are we loo- -- are we still looking at the reading goal and objective? Is that what I'm supposed to be looking at? 5 Q Yeah. We've moved from the April 2019 IEP to the October 2019 IEP. We're still looking at the same reading goal, but I just asked if you could confirm that this is the October 2019 IEP? I don't know. I can't see the date. I don't -- I don't 11 0 It's in the top corner. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Right here (indicating). THE WITNESS: Where is it? 14 JUDGE ST. JOHN: Where my hand is moving. IEP date up in the upper right-hand corner. 16 A So we're on the October 2019 IEP; correct? 17 0 That's what I was asking. 18 A Yes, correct. 19 0 Okay. And D.L.'s goal in this IEP for reading is that he be able to read from a grade appropriate text providing a summary that includes two details by reading various texts and use comprehension strategies to identify four to six important key details with 85 percent accuracy; correct? 24 **A** Correct. 25 Q That's identical from his previous one; correct?



PLAINTIFFS 00001807

IN THE MATTER OF: D.L. v. KALAMAZOO PUBLIC SCHOOLS, DOCKET NO., 21-627515, HEARING VOLUME II

20 Q

21 **A**

22 Q

25 **A**

24

Page 372

Apparently, yes. MR. SICKON: I'd like to move to Petitioner's Exhibit 19, your Honor. (Judge shares exhibit via video) MR. SICKON: This is at 307. Yup, got it. Thank And Ms. Morcom, can you confirm that this is D.L.'s IEP from October of 20202 9 A Correct. 10 Q And his reading goal in this IEP is that he will read a grade appropriate text and provide two details from reading these texts and use comprehension strategies to identify four to six important key details with 80 percent accuracy; 14 is that right? 15 **A** Correct. 16 Q So it would be accurate to say that we've lowered the bar of expectations for D.L. between these three IEP goals because the first two were 85 percent and now it's at 80; right? 19 A

Network Reporting

- STATE WINDE COUNT REPORTERS
800-632-2720

Otherwise, the goals are identical; correct?

Thank you. You also had a discussion with Mr. Bullinger on

a couple of different areas about the subject of concussion

They appear to be, yes.

or trauma.

Correct.

IN THE HATTER OF: D.J., v., KALAMAZDO PUBLIC SCHOOLS, DOCKET NO.: 21-027515, HEARING VOLUME II

January 11, 202

And while you confirmed that nobody spoke directly to you about those concerns, it's possible that those concerns were voiced to another staff member; correct? 4 A Correct. MR. BULLINGER: Objection, your Honor. Calls for speculation. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Well, that was implied in the question, so noted but overruled. 9 A Yeah, that was possible --JUDGE ST. JOHN: (inaudible) sustained. MR. SICKON: Thank you. Nothing further. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Redirect? Re-redirect, wherever we are? Further questions, Mr. Bullinger? MR. BULLINGER: Thank you, Judge. THE WITNESS: Re-redirect? Is that what that is? JUDGE ST. JOHN: After 3:00 o'clock I get a little punchy, so -- we still have one witness to go, so --MR. BULLINGER: Thank you, Judge. I'm just reviewing my notes to make sure that I've got what I need JUDGE ST. JOHN: Sure. MR. BULLINGER: Judge, no further questions. JUDGE ST. JOHN: Okay. Thank you very much, Ms. 24 Morcom. You are excused. You have a wonderful day and please stay safe out there. Okay?

Network Reporting

Page 432 "Student's Current IEP and placement." (Judge shares exhibit via video) 3 Q Did you provide the information for that section? And you noted that D.L. was struggling to make progress; correct? 7 **A** Yes, I did. 8 Q And to what, if anything, did you attribute those struggles? D.L. struggled to make progress towards his goals as well as 10 progress towards graduation requirements due to his 11 struggles to follow classroom rules and expectations, 12 school-wide rules and expectations. He also struggled due 1.3 to attendance to class as well as behavior in class. 14 Q Do you recall whether those struggles were discussed at this 15 16 A It is very typical during a manifestation determination to discuss student's behavior as well as the barriers to their 18 success, which in D.L.'s case was his behavior. And did the team determine that this behavior at this meeting was a manifestation of his disability? 21 A I believe we determined it was not a manifestation of his disability. 23 Q Is that what's reflected on the page that's currently on the screen? 25 **A** Yes.

